

THE WALKERTON INQUIRY

The Honourable Dennis R. O'Connor, Commissioner

180 Dundas St. W., 22nd Floor
Toronto, ON M5G 1Z8

Tel: Toronto Area (416) 326-4498
Outside Toronto Area 1-877-543-8598
Fax: (416) 327-8782



LA COMMISSION D'ENQUÊTE WALKERTON

L'honorable Dennis R. O'Connor, Commissaire

180, rue Dundas Ouest, 22 étage
Toronto, ON M5G 1Z8

Tél: Région de Toronto (416) 326-4498
À l'extérieur de Toronto 1-877-543-8598
Télé: (416) 327-8782

January 14, 2002

The Honourable David Young
Ministry of the Attorney General
720 Bay Street, 11th Floor
Toronto, Ontario
M5G 2K1

Dear Mr. Attorney:

With this letter I transmit my Part 1 report of The Walkerton Inquiry.

Yours very truly,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "D. O'Connor", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Dennis R. O'Connor
Commissioner

Encl.

Walkerton

220 Trillium Court, P.O. Box 789, Bldg. 3, Unit 4, Walkerton, ON N0G 2V0
220 Cour Trillium, C.P. 789, édifice 3, pièce 4, Walkerton, ON N0G 2V0

(519) 881-3936 (tel.) (519) 881-4706 (fax)
(519) 881-3936 (tél.) (519) 881-4706 (fac.)

Part One

Report of the Walkerton Inquiry:

**The Events of May 2000
and Related Issues**

The Honourable Dennis R. O'Connor

Published by
Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General

© Queen's Printer for Ontario 2002

Cover Design: Tania Craan Design

ISBN: 0-7794-2559-6

Copies of this and other Ontario Government publications are available from Publications Ontario at 880 Bay St., Toronto. Out-of-town customers may write to Publications Ontario, 50 Grosvenor St., Toronto M7A 1N8. Telephone (416) 326-5300 or toll-free in Ontario 1-800-668-9938. Fax (416) 326-5317. Internet: www.publications.gov.on.ca. The hearing impaired may call toll-free in Ontario 1-800-268-7095. MasterCard and Visa are accepted. Cheques and money orders should be made payable to the Minister of Finance. Prepayment is required.

Contents

Chapter 1	Introduction	1
Chapter 2	The Impact on Walkerton	41
Chapter 3	The Events in Walkerton in May 2000	55
Chapter 4	The Physical Causes of the Contamination	103
Chapter 5	The Role of the Public Utilities Commission Operators	181
Chapter 6	The Role of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commissioners	217
Chapter 7	The Roles of the Municipalities and Mayors	233
Chapter 8	The Role of the Public Health Authorities	243
Chapter 9	The Role of the Ministry of the Environment	265
Chapter 10	The Failure to Enact a Notification Regulation	365
Chapter 11	The Ministry of the Environment Budget Reductions	404
Chapter 12	Other Government Policies, Practices, and Procedures	417
Chapter 13	The Legislative, Regulatory, and Policy Framework	443
Chapter 14	The Process of Part 1 of the Inquiry	467
Chapter 15	Summary of Recommendations	499
Appendices		

Detailed Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1	Background	2
1.2	Summary of Conclusions	3
1.3	An Overview of This Report	5
1.3.1	The Impact on Walkerton	5
1.3.2	The Bacteria	6
1.3.3	The Events of May 2000	7
1.3.4	The Physical Causes	13
1.3.5	The Role of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commission Operators	15
1.3.6	The Role of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commissioners	18
1.3.7	The Role of the Municipality and the Mayor	19
1.3.8	The Role of the Public Health Authorities	20
1.3.9	The Role of the Ministry of the Environment	23
1.3.9.1	The Approvals Program	25
1.3.9.2	The Inspections Program	26
1.3.9.3	Voluntary and Mandatory Abatement	27
1.3.9.4	Operator Certification and Training	28
1.3.9.5	Other Deficiencies	29
1.3.9.6	Summary	30
1.3.10	The Failure to Enact a Notification Regulation	31
1.3.11	Budget Reductions	34
1.3.12	Other Government Programs	35
1.4	The Scope of the Mandate	35
1.5	Recommendations	38
1.6	The Role of the Coroner	38

Chapter 2 The Impact on Walkerton

2.1 Introduction 42

2.2 Personal Suffering 42

 2.2.1 Tracy Hammell and Her Son Kody 43

 2.2.2 Betty and Norm Borth 45

 2.2.3 The Family of Betty Trushinski 46

 2.2.4 Indirect Impacts 47

2.3 General Health Effects 48

 2.3.1 *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 49

 2.3.2 *Campylobacter jejuni*..... 50

2.4 Deaths and Illnesses 51

Chapter 3 The Events in Walkerton in May 2000

3.1 Overview 56

3.2 The Walkerton Water System 57

3.3 May 1 to May 14 58

3.4 Monday, May 15 60

3.5 Tuesday, May 16 62

3.6 Wednesday, May 17 63

3.7 Thursday, May 18 65

3.8 Friday, May 19 67

3.9 Saturday, May 20 73

3.10 Sunday, May 21 79

3.11 Monday, May 22 88

3.12 Tuesday, May 23 92

3.13 May 24 to May 31 97

Chapter 4 The Physical Causes of the Contamination

4.1	Overview	105
4.2	The Multi-Barrier Approach to Municipal Water Systems	108
4.2.1	Source	108
4.2.2	Treatment	108
4.2.3	Distribution System	110
4.2.4	Monitoring	111
4.2.5	Response	111
4.3	Well 5	112
4.3.1	Warning Signs at the Time of Construction	112
4.3.2	Early Bacteriological and Chemical Results	114
4.3.3	Bacteriological Sampling Results: Wells 5, 6, and 7 and the Distribution System, 1990–2000	116
4.3.4	Geology and Hydrogeology	119
4.3.5	Points of Entry	120
4.3.6	Groundwater Under the Direct Influence of Surface Water	123
4.4	The Source of Contamination	126
4.4.1	The Area Surrounding Well 5	126
4.4.2	Animal Husbandry and Manure	128
4.4.3	The Lifespan of <i>E. coli</i> O157:H7 in Soil	129
4.5	Wells Supplying the System in May	130
4.6	Rainfall	132
4.7	Adverse Samples	133
4.7.1	April 2000 Sampling Results	133
4.7.2	Early May Samples	133
4.7.3	May 15 PUC Sampling	134
4.7.4	May 15 Highway 9 Project Samples	135
4.7.5	May 18 Highway 9 Samples	136
4.7.6	May 21–23 Samples	137
4.7.7	Soil and Water Samples Taken Near Well 5 After the Outbreak	138
4.7.8	DNA and Epidemiological Typing	140
4.7.9	Other Microbiological Evidence	142

4.8	Expert Evidence	143
4.9	The Timing of the Contamination	147
4.9.1	The Onset and Clustering of Illnesses: Epidemiological Evidence	147
4.9.2	Other Evidence Regarding Onset Dates	150
4.9.3	The Onset of Illnesses Leading to Death	153
4.10	The Chlorine Dosage at Well 5 and Residuals in the System	154
4.11	Chlorine and Turbidity Monitoring at Well 5	157
4.12	The Operation of Well 7 Without a Chlorinator	161
4.13	Wells 6 and 7	163
4.13.1	Soil Samples	165
4.13.2	Pump Test Results	166
4.13.3	Other Hydrogeological Evidence	167
4.14	Other Possible Sources of Contamination	167
4.14.1	New Construction	168
4.14.1.1	Highway 9 (Kincardine Highway)	169
4.14.1.2	Old Durham Road	171
4.14.1.3	Ellen Avenue	172
4.14.2	Fire Events	172
4.14.3	Breaks and Repairs	173
4.14.4	Storage Structures (Standpipes)	175
4.14.5	Cross-Connections	175
4.14.6	The Flooding of the Distribution System	176
4.14.7	Biosolids and Septage	177
4.15	Summary.....	179

Chapter 5 The Role of the Public Utilities Commission Operators

5.1	Overview	182
5.2	The Qualifications of the Supervisors	184
5.2.1	Stan Koebel	184
5.2.2	Frank Koebel	187

5.3	Improper Operating Practices	188
5.3.1	Microbiological Sampling	188
5.3.1.1	The Importance of Sampling	188
5.3.1.2	Mislabelling	189
5.3.1.3	Insufficient Sampling	190
5.3.2	Inadequate Chlorination	192
5.3.3	The Failure to Monitor Chlorine Residuals Daily	194
5.3.4	Inaccurate Operating Sheets	195
5.3.5	Inaccurate Annual Reports	196
5.3.6	The Operation of the Wells Without Chlorination	197
5.4	The Relationship Between the Walkerton Public Utilities Commission and the Ministry of the Environment	198
5.5	The Relationship Between Stan Koebel and the Public Utilities Commissioners	204
5.6	Well 5: Continuous Monitors.....	206
5.7	The Working Environment at the Walkerton Public Utilities Commission	208
5.8	The Operators' Response to the May 2000 Outbreak	211
5.9	Allan Buckle	215
5.10	Robert McKay	216
5.11	Conclusions.....	216

Chapter 6 The Role of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commissioners

6.1	Overview	218
6.2	The History of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commission	219
6.3	The Legal Status of Public Utilities Commissions	220
6.4	The Responsibilities of Public Utilities Commissioners	221

6.5	The Expertise of the Walkerton Public Utilities Commissioners	224
6.5.1	The Lack of Knowledge	224
6.5.2	The Reliance on Stan Koebel	226
6.6	The 1998 Ministry of the Environment Inspection Report	227
6.7	Portraits of the Commissioners	229
6.7.1	James Kieffer	229
6.7.2	Richard Field	229
6.7.3	James Bolden	230
6.7.4	David Thomson	231
6.8	Conclusion	232

Chapter 7 The Roles of the Municipalities and Mayors

7.1	Overview	234
7.2	The Town of Walkerton's Failure to Control Land Use in the Vicinity of Well 5	235
7.3	The Town of Walkerton's Response to the 1998 Ministry of the Environment Inspection Report	236
7.4	Mayor Thomson's Initial Response to the Boil Water Advisory	238
7.5	The Failure to Invoke the Brockton Emergency Plan ...	240

Chapter 8 The Role of the Public Health Authorities

8.1	Introduction	244
8.2	The Public Health Branch	246
8.3	Boards of Health and Health Units.....	247
8.4	The Medical Officer of Health	247
8.5	Mandatory Programs and Services	248

8.6	The Bruce-Grey-Owen Sound Health Unit	249
8.6.1	Background	249
8.6.2	The Medical Officer of Health	250
8.7	Overseeing the Safety of Drinking Water	251
8.7.1	Procedures and Policies	251
8.7.2	The Receipt of Adverse Results	252
8.7.3	The Receipt of Ministry of the Environment Inspection Reports	253
8.7.4	The Discontinuation of Public Laboratory Testing	255
8.8	The Boil Water Advisory	258
8.8.1	Boil Water Advisories Generally	258
8.8.2	The Timeliness of the Boil Water Advisory	259
8.8.3	The Dissemination of the Boil Water Advisory	261
8.9	Recommendations	263

Chapter 9 The Role of the Ministry of the Environment

9.1	Introduction	268
9.1.1	Overview	268
9.1.2	The Oversight Role of the Ministry	271
9.1.3	The Organization of the Ministry	273
9.2	Approvals	275
9.2.1	Overview	275
9.2.2	Approvals Instruments	277
9.2.3	The Approval of Walkerton Well 5	278
9.2.3.1	The Construction of Well 5	278
9.2.3.2	The Wilson Report and the Ministry Review	279
9.2.3.3	The Meeting of November 23, 1978	280
9.2.4	The Terms of the Approval	284
9.2.4.1	The Failure to Impose Conditions	284
9.2.4.2	Sending the Wrong Signals	285
9.2.5	The Follow-up to the Approval	287
9.2.5.1	The 1979 Inspection	287
9.2.5.2	Well 5: A Temporary Solution?	288
9.2.6	The Failure to Update the Certificate of Approval	288

9.2.6.1	Evolving Practice: 1980s–1990s	288
9.2.6.2	The Failure to Add Model Conditions for Well 5	291
9.2.6.3	The Failure to Update After the 1994 ODWO Amendments	293
9.2.6.4	Resources in the Approvals Branch	295
9.2.6.5	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	296
9.2.7	The Approval of Wells 6 and 7	297
9.2.8	Recommendations	298
9.3	Inspections	299
9.3.1	Overview	299
9.3.2	The Ministry Inspections in Walkerton	301
9.3.3	The Lack of Instructions to Inspectors Regarding Ministry Files	303
9.3.3.1	The 1998 Inspection	304
9.3.3.2	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	306
9.3.4	The Lack of Clarity in the Instructions to Review Operator Records	307
9.3.4.1	The 1998 Inspection	309
9.3.4.2	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	312
9.3.5	Follow-up Inspections	313
9.3.5.1	Inspection Frequency	313
9.3.5.2	Red Flags Regarding the Walkerton Water System	314
9.3.5.3	The Failure to Conduct a Follow-up Inspection	318
9.3.5.4	The Resources of the Inspections Program	318
9.3.5.5	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	319
9.3.6	Unannounced Inspections	320
9.3.6.1	Ministry Policy Regarding Unannounced Inspections	320
9.3.6.2	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	321
9.3.7	Recommendations	322
9.4	Voluntary and Mandatory Abatement.....	323
9.4.1	Overview	323
9.4.2	Ministry Policies and Practices	324
9.4.2.1	Voluntary and Mandatory Abatement	324
9.4.2.2	The Ministry's Compliance Guideline	325
9.4.2.3	The Culture of Voluntary Abatement	326

9.4.2.4	The Shift Toward Mandatory Abatement	327
9.4.3	Voluntary Abatement for the Walkerton Water System	327
9.4.3.1	The Failure to Issue a Director's Order in 1998	328
9.4.3.2	The Impact on Stan Koebel.....	331
9.4.4	The Ministry's Responses to the Adverse Results in Walkerton in 2000	332
9.5	Operator Certification and Training	335
9.5.1	Overview	335
9.5.2	The Walkerton PUC Employees	336
9.5.2.1	Stan Koebel	337
9.5.2.2	Frank Koebel	338
9.5.2.3	Other PUC Employees	339
9.5.3	The Grandparenting of Water Operators	339
9.5.4	The Training of Water Operators	342
9.5.5	Training Requirements Under Ontario Regulation 435/93	344
9.5.6	The Training of Walkerton PUC Employees	345
9.5.7	Recommendations	346
9.6	The Accessibility of Information	347
9.6.1	Ministry of the Environment Information Systems	347
9.6.2	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	349
9.6.3	Recommendation	350
9.7	The Training of Ministry Personnel	350
9.7.1	The Lack of Adequate Training	350
9.7.2	The Impact on the Events of May 2000	352
9.7.3	The Trends in the Ministry's Training Program	353
9.7.4	Recommendations	355
9.8	The Ontario Drinking Water Objectives and the Chlorination Bulletin	355
9.9	The Ministry's Response to the Boil Water Advisory in May 2000	358
9.10	Ministry Organizational Chart	363

Chapter 10 The Failure to Enact a Notification Regulation

10.1	Overview	367
10.2	The Role of Provincial Government Laboratories Before 1996	370
10.3	The Introduction of Fees in 1993	371
10.3.1	The Impact of the Decision to Introduce Fees	371
10.3.2	The Failure to Regulate Private Laboratories	372
10.3.3	The Contrast to Regulation of Clinical Laboratories	373
10.4	The Move to Privatization in 1995–96	374
10.4.1	The Proposal for Privatization	374
10.4.2	The Decision to Privatize	376
10.4.3	The Failure to Identify and Manage Risks	376
10.4.4	The Decision Not to Require Accreditation	378
10.5	Concerns About the Lack of Notification Before and During Privatization	380
10.5.1	The Survey of Medical Officers of Health in 1995	381
10.5.2	Communications with Municipalities in 1996	381
10.5.3	Communications with Municipalities in 1997	383
10.5.4	Inadequate Communication with Private Laboratories	383
10.5.5	The Failure to Follow Up	384
10.6	Concerns About the Lack of Notification After Privatization	385
10.6.1	The 1996 Letter to Medical Officers of Health	385
10.6.2	The 1997 E-mail Message from the MOE’s Belleville Office	386
10.6.3	The 1997 Survey by the MOE’s Owen Sound Office ..	387
10.6.4	The 1996–97 Reports of the Environmental Commissioner	387
10.6.5	The 1997 Letter from the Simcoe County District Health Unit	388
10.7	The Health Minister’s Request of the Environment Minister	389

10.8	Reasons for the Failure to Enact a Notification Regulation	392
10.9	The Drinking Water Coordination Committee.....	395
10.9.1	The Delay of the 1998 ODWO Revisions	397
10.9.2	The ODWO Revisions Back on the Agenda	397
10.10	The Effect on Walkerton in May 2000	398
10.10.1	The Role of A&L Canada Laboratories	398
10.10.2	The Reduction of the Scope of the Outbreak	401

Chapter 11 The Ministry of the Environment Budget Reductions

11.1	A Background to the Reductions	404
11.2	The Impacts of Budget Reductions on the Events in Walkerton	405
11.3	Warnings About the Impacts	409
11.4	The Cabinet Decision and the Lack of a Risk Assessment	410
11.5	Conclusions.....	412
11.6	Detailed Summary of the Reductions.....	413

Chapter 12 Other Government Policies, Practices, and Procedures

12.1	Introduction	418
12.2	The Energy Competition Act	418
12.3	Municipal Restructuring	421
12.4	The "Who Does What" Policy.....	422
12.5	Provincial Grants and Loans to Municipalities	424
12.6	The Municipal Financing of Waterworks	426

12.7	The Privatization of Municipal Waterworks	428
12.8	Ontario Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs Programs	428
12.8.1	The Ministry's Role in Groundwater Protection	429
12.8.2	Environmental Farm Plans	430
12.8.3	Nutrient Management Plans	430
12.8.4	Best Management Practices	431
12.8.5	The Legislative and Policy Framework	432
12.8.6	Conclusion	432
12.9	The Groundwater Management Strategy	433
12.10	Employee Morale in the Ministry of the Environment	436
12.11	Land Use Planning	437
12.11.1	General	437
12.11.2	The Provincial Role	438
12.11.3	The <i>Planning Act</i>	438
12.11.4	Relevant Provincial Policy Statements	439
12.11.5	The Approval of Official Plans	439
12.11.6	The Role of Municipalities	440
12.11.7	Bruce County's Official Plan	440
12.11.8	Conclusion	441

Chapter 13 The Legislative, Regulatory, and Policy Framework

13.1	Introduction	444
13.2	Constitutional Jurisdiction	444
13.3	The Ontario Legislative and Policy Framework in May 2000	445
13.3.1	The <i>Ministry of the Environment Act</i>	445
13.3.2	The <i>Ontario Water Resources Act</i> and Regulation 435/93	445
13.3.2.1	The Management of Ontario's Water Supply	446
13.3.2.2	The Protection of Ontario's Water Supply	447

13.3.2.3	The Waterworks and Sewage Works Regulation	448
13.3.3	The <i>Environmental Protection Act</i>	449
13.3.4	The <i>Environmental Bill of Rights</i>	450
13.3.5	The <i>Health Protection and Promotion Act</i>	451
13.3.6	The <i>Public Utilities Act</i>	453
13.4	The Ontario Policy Framework in May 2000	454
13.4.1	The <i>Ontario Drinking Water Objectives</i> , 1994	454
13.4.1.1	Unsafe Drinking Water	455
13.4.1.2	Deteriorating Drinking Water Quality	455
13.4.1.3	Exceedance of Maximum Allowable Concentrations	456
13.4.1.4	Monitoring	457
13.4.1.5	Legal Status	457
13.4.2	The Chlorination Bulletin	457
13.4.3	The Drinking Water Protection Regulation	459
13.5	The Regulatory Review Process	460
13.5.1	Overview	460
13.5.2	The Ministry of the Environment's Regulatory Review ..	461
13.5.3	The Red Tape Commission Regulatory Review	462
13.5.4	Impact Tests for Regulatory Review	463

Chapter 14 The Process of Part 1 of the Inquiry

14.1	Introduction	469
14.1.1	Purpose	470
14.1.2	A Broad Mandate	470
14.1.3	The Division of the Mandate	471
14.2	Principles	472
14.2.1	Thoroughness	472
14.2.2	Expedition	473
14.2.3	Openness to the Public	473
14.2.4	Fairness	474
14.3	A Description of the Process	474
14.3.1	Relations with the Community	474
14.3.2	The Rules of Procedure and Practice	475

14.3.3	Standing	476
14.3.3.1	Categories of Standing	477
14.3.4	Funding	477
14.3.5	The Role of Commission Counsel	479
14.3.6	The Role of Investigators	479
14.3.7	Procedural Rights	480
14.3.7.1	The Parties	480
14.3.7.2	Witnesses	480
14.3.7.3	Recipients of a Section 5(2) Notice	481
14.3.7.4	Criminal Investigation	482
14.3.8	The Collection and Production of Documents	482
14.3.9	The Role of the Government	484
14.3.9.1	Document Requests	485
14.3.9.2	Search Warrants	485
14.3.9.3	Document Review	486
14.4	Cabinet Privilege	486
14.4.1	Follow-up Searches: Electronic Searches	487
14.4.2	Follow-up Searches: The Premier's Office	488
14.4.3	Certificates of Production	489
14.5	The Conduct of the Hearings	489
14.6	Public Access	491
14.7	Closing Arguments	497
14.8	Appearances of Counsel	492
14.9	Acknowledgements	495
Chapter 15	Summary of Recommendations	499

Appendices

A Order in Council

B (i) List of Parties

B (ii) List of Witnesses

C (i) Letter to the Residents of Walkerton

C (ii) List of Walkerton Presenters

D (i) Rules of Procedure and Practice

D (ii) Amendment to Rules of Procedure and Practice

D (iii) Letter Re: Standing

D (iv) Procedural Guidelines for Part 1A

D (v) Procedural Guidelines for Part 1B

E (i) Notice of Standing Hearing

E (ii) Ruling on Standing and Funding

E (iii) Supplementary Ruling on Standing and Funding

F (i) Funding Recommendations

F (ii) Funding Guidelines - Rates

G Summons to Witness

H (i) Document Request

H (ii) Search Warrant

H (iii) Letters Re: Cabinet Privilege

H (iv) Undertakings Re: Confidentiality

H (v) Certificate of Production

I (i) Section 5(2) Notice

I (ii) Letter of March 1, 2000 to Recipient of Section 5(2) Notice

I (iii) Letter of March 26, 2000 to Recipient of Section 5(2) Notice

J Rulings on Motions Re: Section 5(2) Notices

K (i) Outline of Potential Issues in Part 1B

K (ii) Commissioner's Statement Re: Decision to Call the Premier

L (i) Closing Submissions Notice

L (ii) Closing Submissions Schedule

L (iii) Closing Submissions Funding Notice #1

L (iv) Closing Submissions Funding Notice #2

